Journal of Educational Research and Development; Vol.5 No.1 March 2022; ISSN (Print): 2682-5201; pg.227 – 236

JOB SATISFACTION AND TURNOVER INTENTION OF EMPLOYEE IN TERTIARY INSTITUTIONS IN ANAMBRA STATE

PROF. ZITA OBI,

&

UCHENNA SYLVESTER IKECHUKWU,

&

OBIDILE, STELLA OGECHUKWU
Chukwuemeka Odumegwu Ojukwu University
Igabriam Campus
Anambra State

Abstract
The study was carried out to investigate job satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. Two research questions guided the study and two null hypotheses were tested. A correlation research design was adopted for the study. The population of the study consisted of 31,890 of employees drawn from five tertiary institutions and a purposive sample technique was used in selecting 12,430 employees. A structured questionnaire was used for data collection. The instrument was validated by three experts in the field. The reliability of the instrument was ensured using pilot test technique. Cronbach Alpha method was used to establish the reliability of the instrument. The reliability yielded coefficient values of .96. Data related to the research questions and hypotheses were analyzed using Pearson Product Moment correlation analysis to test the degree of relationship at .05 level of significance. Findings revealed that there is a negligible negative relationship between pay satisfaction and a significant high positive relationship exists between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. However, it was concluded that the pay satisfaction would enhance turnover of employees in tertiary institutions. It was also recommended that employers should pay adequate attention to the monetary rewards of their employees among others.

Introduction

Tertiary institutions are institutions of higher learning where knowledge is imparted to its seekers and researches are undertaken in various fields of human endeavour. They are at the post-secondary level of the national education system, which include universities, polytechnics, colleges of technology, colleges of education, advanced teacher training colleges, correspondence colleges and such institutions as may be allied to them. These institutions may be publicly or privately owned and are meant to contribute to national development by developing physical and intellectual skills which will enable individuals to become self-reliant and useful members of the society.

It is important to appreciate the fact that, for tertiary institutions to achieve their objectives effectively, there is need to keep employees satisfied, motivated, committed and long serving in their jobs. The improvement of performance in schools especially tertiary institutions totally depends on employees' job satisfaction. Their motivational services are only possible when they are satisfied with their employees leading to efficient and effective outcome. Mbah and Ikemefuna (2012) refer to job satisfaction as the degree of needs satisfaction that is derived from and or experienced on the job. Mbah and Ikemefuna further affirm to the ability of employees in organization aspirations, feeling happy doing their job with the hope that their needs will be achieved.

Tertiary institutions motivational services are only possible when they are satisfied with their employees leading to efficient and effective outcome. This involves that employees' motivation would enhance the students' learning positively. On the other hand, the unsatisfied employees could never produce good results and affect the students' performance relatively. Thus, it has significantly become necessary for the employees in the field of education particularly consider job satisfaction and motivation for upliftment of their organizations. In view of this, Alam and Asim (2019) opined that satisfaction with the job is the most important factor that predicts the turnover intention. Kartika and Purba (2018) stated that employees who are satisfied with all aspects of their job; the work itself, pay, supervision, promotion and coworkers voluntarily identify themselves as part of the organization by adjusting to the values, vision, mission and goals of the organization. It means that they have a strong intention to stay and a low turnover intention. Employees became dissatisfied with their job because of poor condition of service and lack of motivational strategies on the part of the employer (Shaibu, 2014).

Employee job satisfaction has influence on employee turnover in organizations. The implication of this is that the extent to which an organization is able to retain its employees' depend on the level of job satisfaction that are made available to these workers. Job satisfaction is known to have positive impact on employee turnover intentions. It means that dissatisfaction on the job increases or will increase the rate of employee turnover intention in any institutions. Organizations around the world are striving to be the best in attracting and retaining its employees. Various strategies have been practiced and implemented to attract and retain employees in the organization in order to reduce the turnover rate.

Employee turnover is a vital issue and challenges for human resources management strategies and organization performance (Davidson, Timo & Wang, 2010). Employee turnover has always been a matter of concern for organizations. A large degree of employee turnover may be detrimental to both the organization as well as the employees. Turnover has an impact over the organization's costs relating to recruitment and selection, personnel process and induction, training of new personnel and above all, loss of knowledge gained by the employee while on job (Shweta, 2014). Additionally, it results in understaffing which in turn lead to decreased effectiveness and productivity of the remaining staff. Turnover may have a negative impact on the employee as well. The individual may lose non-invested benefits and may be a victim of the grass looks greener phenomenon. Most often, turnover intention is consequential to actual quitting behavior.

Many researchers have conducted empirical researches on the impact of high turnover on productivity. Employee turnover in higher education has been one of the most critical issues for many years. Both practitioners and researchers dedicated huge efforts and time to identify and understand the ways to reduce employee turnover (Abdulraheem & Adebola, 2014). Many works on employee turnover focus on the issues of high employees' turnover and how to manage it within many sectors. The highest turnover rate in financial services particularly in tertiary institutions has great impact on productivity, quality and profitability due to the loss of knowledge and technical skills. The turnover rate of any organization will impact the organization's operation cost in investing trainings that required for new employee and eventually will impact the end profit of the organization.

Employee turnover has gained greater attention of most government and organizations all over the world because they have faced this challenge at some stage of their development in recent time (Zahra, Irum, Saad & Chishti, 2013). In Nigeria, contemporary work organizations, employees' turnover intentions have increased tremendously, because of the problems associated with workers' standard of livings. Employees are searching for lucrative jobs that will offer them expected income to cater for their social-economic well-being, particularly as a result of the current economic recession in the country. Searching for new job outside their current organizations prepare them to leave for another job opportunity elsewhere. It is widely recognized and that, identifying and dealing with antecedents of turnover intentions is an effective way of reducing actual turnover (Faloye, 2014). Souse-Poza in Ezeh and Olawale (2017) described turnover intention as a reflection of probability that an individual will change his or her job within a certain period and is an immediate precursor to actual turnover. Turnover intention is a measurement of whether organization's employees plan to leave their position or the organization plans to remove employees from their positions (Faloye, 2014).

Furthermore, Issa, Ahmad and Gelaidan (2013) viewed turnover intention as an employee's thought of voluntary quitting his job which in turn will certainly impact performance and could impact his organization contribution. Delle (2013) refers to turnover intention as the voice in one's head saying that this organization is not the suitable place for me and this organization is not a good place to be and this is not what I feel like doing. However, this voice might be reduced and turnover intention might be diminished as a result of the appearance of other factors which might influence the person's decision. Omonijo, Oludayo, Eche, Uche and Ohunakin (2015) perceived turnover intention as self-withdrawal of service. Issa and Adebola (2014) argued that employees leave or intent to leave an organization for a number of reasons, including but not limited to poor compensation policy, job demand, poor work environment, dissatisfaction with the job, dissatisfaction with the organization, inability to cope with responsibility, moving out of the familiar work setting, inability to get on with colleagues and line managers, career development or career change and domestic reasons.

Employee satisfaction is critical to the sustainability of an organization (Reukauf, 2017). In organizations, when workers are dissatisfied, they tend to move and search for satisfaction somewhere else. Ali, ZhongBin, JianPing, Ali and Sultan (2018) stated that job satisfaction can be used to assess employee turnover and it has a major impact on organizational productivity, morbidity and performance. However, Issa and Adebola assumed that the most reason for employees' high turnover rate is related to job satisfaction and this has a direct impact on attracting job retention and reducing turnover. For the purpose of this study, one shall look at job satisfaction in two forms to include pay satisfaction and gender.

Pay is generally accepted as a factor of great importance in the workplace (Rynes, Gerhart & Minnett in Ezeh and Olawale, 2017) and studies have emphasized on it as a determinant and correlate of many different organizational variables (Harris, Anseel & Lievens in Issa & Adebola, 2014). Job satisfaction has a very close link with the salary. The quality of education can be improved if the teaching performance is given certain incentives by the academia for education excellence. Work reward is in different forms like pay or bonuses for the workers. Pay is one of the oldest and commonest factors responsible for employees' turnover. Manu et al (2012) concludes that employees quit from organization due to economic reasons, while Hissom, (2013) argued that the most common reason for employees turnover rate being so high is salary scale since employees are usually in search of jobs that pay well. Undoubtedly, in a situation whereby two employees perform the similar work with similar responsibilities and yet one of the employees is at advantage when it come to remuneration obviously the employees that is at disadvantage will surely be looking for a better offer. It is not uncommon to find out that organizations that pay less will have a higher labour turnover than those that pay higher (Abdulraheem & Adebola, 2014).

In terms of the empirical research, most of the studies on pay satisfaction and turnover intention reported a negative relationship (Williams, McDaniel & Nguyen in Eze and Olowale, 2017). Williams, McDaniel and Nguyen in Eze and Olowale (2017) found that pay level satisfaction was significantly negative correlates with several important organizational outcomes, including turnover intention, and voluntary turnover. This shows that, turnover/turnover intention decrease with an improvement with pay. Rizqi and Ridwan (2015) examined the direct and indirect effects of pay satisfaction and affective commitment on turnover intention, which is mediated by affect commitment. Data was gathered among 150 employees of an automotive manufacturing company in Indonesia. Path analysis was adopted to test the data. Results showed that turnover intention was significantly predicted by both pay satisfaction and affective commitment, while affective commitment was significantly predicted by pay satisfaction. Another job satisfaction is gender.

According to Sousa-Poza and Sousa-Poza (2007) discussing the difference between gender intentions to leave has far-reaching consequences because differing job-mobility inclinations between genders affect probability of being promoted, accumulation of human capital, and wages. Choong, Keh, Tan and Tan (2013) examined the impact of demographic antecedents toward turnover intention amongst academic staff in Malaysian Private Universities. Proportionate stratified sampling technique was employed with a total of 377 samples were collected. One-way ANOVA and Independent sample t-test were adopted to test the hypotheses. Results showed that significant differences between gender and marital status toward turnover invention, therefore, female has higher intention to leave as compared to male, while married respondents have higher job commitment as compared to single respondents.

Abubakar, Chauhan and Kura (2013) explored the role of demographic variables in predicting turnover intention among registered Nurses in Nigeria Public hospitals. 175 registered Nurses participated in the study. The findings indicated that male nurses were more likely to leave their organizations or profession than their female colleagues. In a study conducted by Sicherman in Ezeh and Olawale (2017) using a private company’s personnel records, found that after controlling for personal and job characteristics, men and women showed similar turnover patterns. But, when different reasons for turnover were considered, there were significant differences in turnover behaviors between men and women. For example, women were more likely to leave their jobs for personal or family-related reasons. Lyness and Judiesch in Ezeh and Olawale (2017) suggested that employers may equate ‘female’ with ‘quitter’ because women have higher average turnover rates than men.

Furthermore, Khatri, Budhwar and Fern (2009) observed that findings on gender and turnover intentions are mixed. For instance, some researchers discovered that female employees were more likely to quit or tended to have greater intention to leave their workplace than their male counterparts. However Judeh, (2012) revealed that male employees have greater intention to leave or seek other employment opportunities than their female counterparts. Males are the caretakers of their family and they have greater achievement orientation than females. Khatri, Budhwar and Fern (2009) added that males may leave their current jobs in favor of a more attractive job if their expectations are not met in their present job.

However, Atef, El-Leithy and Al-kalyoubi (2017), contended that organizations with low turnover and turnover intention are more productive and more efficient because low turnover is considered as a symptom of employees’ job satisfaction, job involvement, work engagement and organizational commitment. Dess and Shaw in Ezeh and Olawale (2017) categorized the cost associated with employee turnover into direct and indirect costs. Direct cost entails the recruitment and selection costs and costs associated with training of new staff while indirect cost of turnover include reduction in morale among remaining staff, work overload, and loss of social capital. This implies that when employees are satisfied with their job and organization, they are more likely to be fully engaged and pleased with the whole processes of the organization. But, in case of inequality in the distribution of justice and reward employees are more likely to get stuck and prepare their mind to look for job in a desirable organization.

Employee turnover intention has become a harmful disease to the survival and health of any organization which tertiary institutions is one part. The efficiency and effectiveness of many organizations have often been threatened by the huge costs of turnover intention on the wellbeing of these organizations. Among various factors influencing the intentions of a person to quit the job, job satisfaction has been found to be most influential. People satisfied from their jobs, do their work with full interest and loyalty and have low intent to quit the organization and vice-versa. In today's changing contours of work and employment where one organization career is becoming rare, employers should keep their employees satisfied so that they rarely think to leave. High turnover rate is a problematic and has negative effects on tertiary institution's performance and effectiveness. Considering the significance of job satisfaction or dissatisfaction in influencing the intentions of employees to quit the organization, the present study was designed to examine the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.

Purpose of the Study

The main purpose of this study is to examine the correlation between job satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. Specifically, the study sought to investigate whether there are:

1. Relationship between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.
2. If there are difference between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.

Research Questions

The following research questions guided this study:

1. What is the relationship between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State?
2. What is the relationship between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State?

Hypotheses

The following null hypotheses were tested at .05 level of significance:

1. There is no significant negative correlation between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.
2. There is no significant difference between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.

Method

Correlation research design was adopted for the study. The researchers considered this design appropriate for this study since it intended to determine the relationships between independent variable (job satisfaction) and turnover intention of employees (dependent variable). The population for the study consisted of 31890 employees drawn from five tertiary institutions Nwafor Orizu College of Education-Nsugbe, Federal College of Education (Tech)-Umunze, Federal Polytechnic Oko, Madona University Okija, Chukwuemeka Odumegu Ojukwu University Uli and Nnamdi Azikiwe University Awka. A purposive sample technique was used selecting 12430 employees. Out of the 12430 employees, 4412 were males and the remaining 8018 were females. A 10-item structured questionnaire was used in gathering data for the study. The questionnaire was validated by three experts in the field. Cronbach Alpha method was used to establish the reliability of the instrument. The reliability yielded coefficient values of .96.

The questionnaire was structured on a four-point rating scale with response categories as "Strongly Agree"; "Agree"; "Disagree" and "Strongly Disagree". The researchers administered 12,430 copies of copies of the questionnaire to the respondents with the help of three research assistants. Out of this number, 12004 copies of the questionnaire were retrieved and used for data analysis. The research questions and hypotheses were analyzed using Pearson product moment for correlation analysis was also used to test the degree of relationship. For the two research questions the coefficient (r) and the size of the relationship was interpreted using the interpretation of a correlation coefficient by Best and Kahn (2003). For the hypotheses, a null hypothesis was rejected if the probability (P) value obtained is less than the significance level of 0.05 whereas a null hypothesis was not rejected if the probability (P) value obtained is greater than the significance level of .05.using the real limit of numbers.

Results

Research Question 1

What is the relationship between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State?

Table 1: Pearson's Correlation between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees

	No of Respondents	Pay Satisfaction	Turnover Intention of Employees	Remark
Pay satisfaction	12004	1	-.047	Negligible Negative
Turnover Intention of Employees	12004	-.047	1	

Table 1 shows that the Pearson's Correlation Coefficient, r. (12004) = -.047. This shows that there is a negligible negative relationship between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. This relationship also depicts that as pay satisfaction increases, turnover intention decreases by .047 and vice versa.

Research Question 2

What is the relationship between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State?

Table 2: Pearson's Correlation between male and female on turnover intention of employees

	No of Respondents	Male and Female	Turnover Intention of Employees	Remark
Male and Female	12004	1	.872	
				Positive
Turnover Intention of Employees	12004	.872	1	

Table 2 shows the Pearson's Correlation Coefficient, r. (12004) = .872. This indicates that a high positive relationship exist between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.

Testing the Hypotheses

Null Hypothesis 1

There is no significant negative correlation between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.

Table 3: Pearson's Correlation between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees

	No of Respondents	Pay satisfaction	Turnover Intention of Employees	P-value	Remark
Pay satisfaction	12004	1	-.047		
				.866	Negative
Turnover Intention of Employees	12004	-.047	1		

Data analysis in Table 3 shows that there is no significant relationship between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State, r (12004) = -.047, *P*-value > 0.05. The null hypothesis was not rejected.

Null Hypothesis 2

There is no significant difference between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State.

Table 4: Pearson's Correlation between male and female on turnover intention of employees

Respondents	No of	Male and Female	Turnover Intention of Employees	P-value	Remark
Male and female	12004	1	.872		
				.000	Positive
Turnover intention of employees	12004	.872	1		

Table 4 shows that there is a significant positive relationship between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State, r. (12004) = .872, *P*-value <0.05. The null hypothesis was rejected.

Discussion of the Findings

The findings of first research question revealed that there is a negligible negative relationship between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. This implies that higher the job satisfaction, lower is the individual's intention to quit the job. This shows that job satisfaction or dissatisfaction plays a significant role in influencing the turnover intentions of employees. People satisfied from their jobs, do their work with full interest and loyalty and have low intent to quit the organization and vice versa. The finding was in agreement with the view of Eze and Olowale (2017) who indicated that pay satisfaction and turnover intention reported a negative relationship. This implies that when workers are satisfied with their job intention to leave their present job will not come to mind. But, if on the other way round employees tend to think of leaving which will propel them to start looking for job elsewhere and lead to their actual turnover. Therefore, increase in job satisfaction will result in decrease in employee turnover. The Pearson correlation revealed that there is no significant relationship between pay satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. It followed therefore that the null hypothesis was not rejected.

The finding of second research question revealed that there is a significant high positive relationship exists between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. The findings of the study are similar to the findings of Judeh (2012) who revealed that male employees have greater intention to leave or seek other employment opportunities than their female counterpart. In support of this, Khatri, Budhwar and Fern (2009) added that males may leave their current jobs in favor of a more attractive job if their expectations are not met in their present job. Pearson correlation revealed that there is a significant positive relationship between male and female on turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State. It followed therefore that the null hypothesis was rejected.

Conclusion

Based on the findings of the study, the present study found a significant negative relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention of employees in tertiary institutions in Anambra State, suggesting thereby that higher the job satisfaction, lower is the individual's intention to quit the job. This shows that job satisfaction or dissatisfaction plays a significant role in influencing the turnover intentions of employees. People satisfied from their jobs, do their work with full interest and loyalty and have low intent to quit the organization and vice-versa. It was also concluded that the pay satisfaction would enhance turnover of employees in tertiary institutions. In today's changing contours of work and employment where one organization career is becoming rarer, employers should keep their employees satisfied so that they rarely think to leave.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study, the following recommendations are made:

1. Employers should pay adequate attention to the monetary rewards and keep their employees satisfied so that they rarely think to leave.
2. Institutions should have a clear cut legislation related to pay packages and promotion policy of employees according to their academic qualification and teaching experience.
3. Job satisfaction of employees could be improved upon by introducing on - the - job benefits (housing loan, medical services, opportunity to learn new skills, and so on). This in turn, will improve their confidence in the organization.

REFERENCES

Abubakar, R.A., Chauhan, A., & Kura, K.M. (2013). Role of demographic variables in predicting turnover intention among registered nurses in Nigeria public hospitals. *International Journal of Business and Technopreneurship, 4*(3), 373-383.

Alam, A. & Asim, M. (2019). Relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies, 9(2),* 163-194.

Ali, A., ZhongBin, L., JianPing, H., Ali, Z., & Sultan, U. (2018). Examining the relationships among job satisfaction, organizational commitment and turnover intentions in manufacturing sector of Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 8(8),* 24-41.

Atef, G., El-Leithy., & Al-Kalyoubi, M. (2017). Factor affecting employees' turnover intention. *International Business Management, 11*(1), 118-130.

Best, J. W., & Kahn, J. V. (2003). *Research in education*.9th Edition. India: Dorling Kindersley Pvt Ltd.

Choong, Y.O., Keh, C.G., Tan, Y.T., & Tan, C.E. (2013). Impacts of demographic antecedents toward turnover intention amongst academic staff in Malaysia private universities. *Australian Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences, 7*(6), 46-54.

Davidson, M., Timo, N. & Wang, Y., (2010). How much does labour turnover costs?: A case study of Australian four- and five- star hotels. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 22 (4), 451-466.

Delle, E. (2013). The influence of perception of organizational politics on employee job involvement and turnover intentions: Empirical evidence from Ghanian organizations. *Journal of Business Management, 5,* 150-160.

Ezeh, N. L., & Olawale, K. (2017). Pay satisfaction, job satisfaction and gender as correlates of turnover intention among Federal Civil Servants in Awka Metropolis of Anambra State, South-East, Nigeria. *International Journal of Advanced Multidisciplinary Research Reports, 2*(1), 1-15.

Faloye, D.O. (2014). Organizational commitment and turnover intentions: Evidence from Nigeria Paramilitary organization. *International Journal of Business and Economic Development, 2*(3), 23-37.

Hissom, M. M. (2012) Job satisfaction and employees turnover intention in total Nigeria Plc. Lagos. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, 2*(12), 567 – 575

Issa, A. & Adebola, D. E. (2014). The implications of employees turnover in Nigeria higher education. *Journal of Research and Development, 1(10),* 44-53.

Issa, A.M., Ahmad, F., & Gelaiden, H.M. (2013). Job satisfaction and turnover intention based on sales person standpoint. *Middle-East Journal of Science Research, 14*(1), 525-531.

Kartika, G. & Purba, D. (2018). Job satisfaction and turnover intention: The mediating effect of affective commitment. *Psychological Research on Urban Society, 1*(2), 100-106.

Khatri, N., Budhwar, P., & Fern, C. T. (2009). Employee turnover: Bad attitude or poor management? *Retrieved from http://www.google.com.ng/url*

Manu, A.U., Clark, D.A., & Kuri, S (2012), Retention and turnover in an organization. *Asian Journal of Business Management, 1*(5), 285 - 304

Mbah, E. S., & Ikemefuna, O. C. (2012). Job satisfaction and employees' turnover intentions in total Nigeria plc., Lagos State. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 2*(14), 275-287.

Omonijo, D.O., Oludayo, O.A., Eche, G.A., Uche, O.O., & Ohunakin, F. (). (2015). Intentional turnover of the administrative staff in private Faith-Based Higher Institution, Southwest, Nigeria. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, 6*(2), 424-434.

Reukauf, J. A. (2017). The correlation between job satisfaction and turnover intentions in small business. Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies.

Rizqi, A.N., & Ridwan, S. (2015). The effects of pay satisfaction and effect of commitment on turnover intention, international *Journal of Research Studies in Psychology, 4*(2), 57-70.

Shaibu, R. (2014). Factors influencing job satisfaction and turnover intentions in commercial banks. *Master's Thesis* submitted to the Department of Resource Management in the Open University of Tanzania

Shweta, J. H. A. (2014). Determinants of employee turnover intentions: A review. *Management Today, 9*(2), 1-13.

Sousa-Poza, A., & Sousa-Poza, A. A. (2007). The effect of job satisfaction on labor turnover by gender: Analysis for Switzerland. *Journal of Socio-Economics, 3*(6), 95-913.

Zahra, S., Irun, A., Saad, M., & Chisati, A. (2013). Job satisfaction and faculty turnover intentions: A case of Pakistian Universities. *Journal of Business and Management, 9*(2), 47-58.